

# A Taste of Text: Source based learning for Shabbat

*This weekly sheet is brought to you by Rabbi Dr. Moshe Freedman of the New West End United Synagogue in conjunction with Shapell's/Darché Noam*

## PARSHAT HAAZINU

### DVAR TORAH: IMPACT AND UNDERSTANDING

The Malbim points out a seeming repetition in our parshah. Immediately after the song of Haazinu is completed, the Torah says that Moshe "said all words of this song in the ears of the nation, he and Hosheia (Yehoshua) son of Nun" (Devarim 32:44). But immediately preceding the song (at the end of Parshat Vayeilech) the Torah already said, "Moshe said the words of the song in the ears of the people of Israel until their completion" (31:30). Aren't these two verses saying the same thing?

The Malbim notes two differences between the verses.

1. While the verse preceding the song says that he said over the words of the song, "until their completion," the later verse merely says that Moshe said "all the words of the song."
2. The verse after the song adds, "he (Moshe), and Hosheia son of Nun."

A speaker communicating a moral message has two goals in mind: he wants his message to make a powerful impact on the listener and he wants it to be understood well. A moral message must make a powerful enough impact on a person that he or she will translate it into action, even when there is internal or external resistance. The message must speak to the heart and it must ring in the listener's ears during crucial moments of moral choice. But the message, especially if it is a subtle or complex one, must also be understood correctly. The ideas must be clarified and the meaning of the words and sentences must be explained.

However, the methods for accomplishing these two goals are not always identical. To achieve maximum impact an entire literary creation must be presented as one unit, without interruptions. The speaker can then engineer a listening experience that engages the heart through slowing down and speeding up, or raising and lowering his voice. In addition, it is often new and fresh material that makes the greatest impact on the listener. On the other hand, in order to make sure the listeners completely understand what is said they have to be able to ask questions, stop and analyze the words, and flesh out the ideas.

Moshe, explains the Malbim, had these two goals in mind as he communicated the Song of Haazinu to the People of Israel. He wanted the Song to have a powerful impact and he wanted the people to understand it well. So Moshe first gave over the entire song to the people once, from beginning to end, without any breaks. That way the whole song was embedded on Israel's hearts. That is what the verse immediately preceding the song refers to: "Moshe said the words of the song ... until their completion."

However, the song requires serious study in order to unlock the secret meanings within it; so Moshe went over the song with them again, this time teaching it to them section by section. This is to what the verse immediately following the song refers. After explaining each of the sections Moshe then went over the whole song again, and, to make sure the message was communicated properly, Yehoshua also went over it with them, as the verse ends, "he and Hosheia son of Nun." As a result, each of the Israelites heard the song four times, for maximum impact and understanding.

## SOURCE GUIDE: SINGING TREES

Waving the lulav, the נענועים, is one of our most beautiful and mysterious mitzvah activities. In this source guide we'll take a closer look at waving the lulav, understanding its underlying halachic nature, and, hopefully, enriching our experience on this coming Sukkot. It is based on the teachings of two Acharonim who lived in the early 1900s: Harav Moshe Soloveitchik, זצ"ל (quoted in Reshimot Shiurim, Harav Tzvi Reichman's presentation of Harav Yosef Soloveitchik זצ"ל's shiurim on Sukkah), and Harav Mordechai Kalina זצ"ל (in his correspondence with the Rogotchover Gaon, זצ"ל, recorded in Michtevei Torah). They develop parallel approaches, both showing that there are two aspects of the נענועים.

### A. Waving the lulav is part of the mitzvah.

To fulfill the mitzvah of the four species on a biblical level we merely have to take the lulav, as the Torah says, ולקחתם לכם, "take for yourselves" the four species (Vayikra 23:40). But waving the lulav is a rabbinic level of taking the lulav, says the Shibulei Haleket (366). He compares the relationship between taking the lulav and the waving it to destroying the chametz (ביעור), and checking for it (בדיקה). Just as checking for chametz is a rabbinical component of the mitzvah of destroying it, the נענועים are the rabbinic component of taking the four species. There are three indications that shaking the lulav is an essential part of the mitzvah, albeit on a rabbinic level:

#### a. Educating for the mitzvah:

<p><u>1. Mishnah Sukkah 3:15</u> A child who knows how to wave is obligated in the mitzvah of lulav.</p>	<p style="text-align: right;"><u>סוכה ג:טו</u> קטן הידע לנענע, חייב בלולב.</p>
--	--

Chinuch (mitzvah education) for the mitzvah of lulav is contingent on the child's ability to do נענועים.

b. An early morning mitzvah: The Gemara (Berakhot 30a) says that someone who must leave home before the earliest time for saying the Shema should still shake the lulav, blow the shofar, or read the megillah. Waving the lulav is spoken about as the mitzvah act of the lulav the same way we speak of the mitzvah acts of the shofar or megillah.

#### c. Minimum measurement of the lulav:

<p><u>2. Sukkah 32b</u> Rav Yehudah, quoting Shmuel, said: The minimum size of a hadas and aravah is three handbreadths, whereas [the minimum size of a] lulav is four, in order that the lulav should extend one handbreadth beyond the hadas.</p>	<p style="text-align: right;"><u>סוכה לב:</u> אמר רב יהודה אמר שמואל: שיעור הדס וערבה שלשה ולולב ארבעה כדי שיהא לולב יוצא מן ההדס טפח.</p>
---	--

The reason for the difference in minimum length, says the Gemara, is so נענועים can be done with the extra tefach of the lulav (Sukka 32b). If a lulav lacks the physical ability to do נענועים it is invalid (Even though the mitzvah can be fulfilled without doing the נענועים, the ability to do them is essential, even on a biblical level). All of these indicate that waving the lulav is part of the mitzvah of taking the lulav.

### B. Waving the lulav is a type of prayer.

However, there are indications that an entirely different dimension of the נענועים exists.

<p><u>3. Sukkah 32b</u> The reason behind Beit Hillel's approach [to shake the lulav during the words, "Please save us, Hashem"] even though it is not the end or beginning of a chapter of Hallel is because it is written, "Then the trees of the forest will sing out before Hashem for He comes to judge the world" (Divrei Hayamim I 16:33) and that is followed by "Thank Hashem for He is good, for his lovingkindness is eternal" (verse 34) and also "Save us the G-d of our salvation" (verse 35). This is the meaning of [the trees] "singing" – that we shake the lulav and praise at "הודו and אנא ה' הושיעה נא.</p>	<p style="text-align: right;"><u>תוספות סוכה לז:</u> וטעמא דבית הלל אע"פ שאין "אנא ה' הושיעה נא" תחלת הפרק ולא סוף הפרק מנענעים משום דכתיב, (דה"א טז) "אז ירננו עצי היער מלפני ה' כי בא לשפוט את הארץ, וכתוב בתריה "הודו לה' כי טוב כי לעולם חסדו", וכתוב נמי בתריה "ואמרו הושיענו אלהי ישענו." והיינו "ירננו" שמנענעים את הלולב ומשבחין בהודו ובאנא ה' הושיעה נא.</p>
---	--

The trees, represented by the lulav, etrog, hadasim and aravot, join us in our Hallel. Shaking at those particular points in Hallel, say the Tosafot, is a form of prayer.

Through waving the lulav we express two different types of prayer – praise during “Hodu” and request during “Ana Hashem.” This is reflected in the two aggadot explaining waving and shaking on Sukka 37b.

<p>4. Sukkah 37b  Rabbi Yochanan said: We wave back and forth to He who the four directions are His, and we wave up and down to He who the heavens and the earth are His.</p> <p>In the West (Israel, west of Bavel) they taught: Rav Chama son of Ukva quoted Rabbi Yosi son of Chanina said – We wave back and forth to counter dangerous winds (from the four directions) and up and down to stop dangerous dews.</p>	<p>סוכה לז:  אמר רבי יוחנן: מוליך ומביא למי שהארבע רוחות שלו, מעלה ומוריד למי שהשמים והארץ שלו.</p> <p>במערבא מתנו הכי: אמר רבי חמא בר עוקבא אמר רבי יוסי ברבי חנינא – מוליך ומביא כדי לעצור רוחות רעות מעלה ומוריד כדי לעצור טללים רעים.</p>
--	---

The first source relates to the נענועים as prayers of praise, and the second relates to the נענועים as requests.

C. There are two components to shaking the lulav.

A number of curious points lead these two acharonim, Harav Moshe Soloveitchik, זצ"ל, and Harav Mordechai Kalina, זצ"ל, to assert that there are two co-existing components of the נענועים.

## 2 Questions

a. Why do we shake the lulav before Hallel, immediately after making the blessing over the lulav? This seems to go against an explicit Mishnah (Sukkah 37b) that asks when to wave the lulav and answers: during “Hodu Lashem ki tov” and “Ana Hashem hoshia na” in Hallel. It does not answer, “After the brachah” (like we do). Tosafot quotes sources to support these initial נענועים, but we are left with a question: Why are there נענועים both inside and outside of Hallel?

b. Rava in the Gemara (Sukkah 37b) compares waving a lulav to waving a sacrifice (תנופה). But whereas a sacrifice is only waved, a lulav is also shaken (according to the Ritva, R’ah, Ran, and others). Why do we stray from the sacrificial model by shaking, not just waving?

## The Duality of the Naanuim

If we assume that the נענועים have two components: a rabbinic level of the mitzvah of taking the lulav and a physical form of prayer joined by the trees of the 4 species, our questions are answered.

a. The Mishnah only refers to the prayer aspect of the נענועים that is done during Hallel. But before Hallel, immediately after saying the blessing over the lulav, we do נענועים to fulfill the mitzvah of lulav with its rabbinic component.

b. Shaking the leaves of the lulav, not only waving the entire lulav, stems from the prayer aspect of the נענועים. How can the lulav sing if its leaves do not rustle? That additional element, “All of the trees of the forest will then sing out before G-d,” does not apply to a waving sacrifice, so there is no additional shaking. The lulav’s leaves, though, must also make a noise.

## SUKKOT AND SHALOM BAYIT BY RABBI MENDEL FARBER

During Sukkot in the Beit Hamikdash we surrounded the מזבח with tall massive Aravah branches. According to Rabbi Eliezer (Sukkah 45a), the Kohanim, as they took leave of the altar, would say לִי-הָ וּלְךָ מִזְבֵּחַ [this beauty is] for G-d and for you, altar. Out of all of the possible Divine Names, they chose to use י-ה. Why?

The same two-letter name appears in the unity of a man and woman, אִישׁ and אִשָּׁה, where אִישׁ has a yud and אִשָּׁה has a hei. The same Divine Name that unites the chatan and kallah into a single Divine new existence also joins the different parts of the Mikdash into a unified Divine organism.

We also see the name י-ה appear in the Gemara's discussion of the Simchat Beit Hashoeivah. The Mishnah (Sukkah 5:4), describing the service of drawing the water for the נִסּוּךְ הַמֵּיִם on Sukkot, tells us that at dawn, after a whole night of dancing, the Kohen stood at the head of the stairs leading from the Ezrat Yisrael to the Ezrat Nashim. The Mishnah continues to tell us that there were fifteen steps between the men's section and the women's section. The Kohen did not make one uninterrupted descent down those fifteen steps, but divided his descent into two stages, one five steps (the numerical value of a hei) and one ten steps (the numerical value of a yud). He stopped in the middle, blew the shofar, and then continued down the remaining steps to the floor of the Ezrat Nashim. The men's section, the Ezrat Yisrael, was connected with the women's section, the Ezrat Nashim, with a י' and a ה', with fifteen steps divided into two groups, ten and five. Those fifteen steps were in reality a connection between the אִישׁ מִיִּשְׂרָאֵל and the אִשָּׁה מִיִּשְׂרָאֵל, the Jewish man and woman.

As is known, the Mikdash was built in the form of a human being, צֶלֶם אֱלֹהִים, made in the Divine image. That Divine image is a combination of a man and a woman. Perhaps this is the reason that the Sages went to such lengths to enable the women to participate in the שְׂמֵחַת בֵּית הַשְּׂוֹאֵבָה, as described by the Gemara (Sukkah 51b-52a).

These two services, that of the Aravah and that of the Simchat Beit Hashoeivah, were linked to the drawing of the water to be poured on the מזבח. That service, the נִסּוּךְ הַמֵּיִם, was meant to reconnect the "lower waters" to the "upper waters," to fulfill Hashem's promise at Creation to reunite them after dividing them on the second day. This is the function of the Name י-ה, to join this world created with the ה', with the transcendent world created with the י'. The energy through which the ultimate union – the amalgamation of the heavens and the earth into a single Divine existence – will take place, flows through Hashem's Name י-ה. It is that Name that emanates from above the כֶּסֶף הַכְּבוֹד and it is that Name that is planted in the Hebrew words for man and woman, אִישׁ and אִשָּׁה, and merges them into a single unitary existence. That merger, in turn, serves as the basis and beginning of the unity we dream of, the unity for which the world was created. Shalom bayit, peace in the Jewish home, not only facilitates a happy marriage; it is even more, it is the root out of which the awesome unity of all existence begins and grows.

Dedicated in memory of  
Malka bat Zalman Yehuda (Mollie Frager), ז"ל

*This publication is compiled by the staff and Rabbonim at **Shapells/Yeshivat Darché Noam** for men and **Midreshet Rachel v'Chaya Seminary** for women in Jerusalem. Find out more about the **married couples' programme** and the **Pathways Israel** and **Pathways Plus** programmes offered at [www.darchenoam.org](http://www.darchenoam.org) +972-2-651-1178, 5 Beit Hakerem Street, Jerusalem.*

To dedicate a Taste of Text, please email Rabbi Freedman at  
[rabbi.dr.moshefreedman@gmail.com](mailto:rabbi.dr.moshefreedman@gmail.com)

For back issues and other articles by Rabbi Freedman please see  
[www.moshefreedman.com](http://www.moshefreedman.com)